

COMMENT ON “PHASE TRANSITION-LIKE BEHAVIOR IN A LOW-PASS FILTER”

JACK L. URETSKY High Energy Physics Division, Argonne National Laboratories

February 2, 2008

Krivine and Lesne use an example taken from The Feynman Lectures[2] in an attempt to illustrate that “many interesting physical properties can however be missed because of the improper use of mathematical techniques”. [1] The supposedly incorrect mathematical procedure has to do with an ordering of limits. An infinite series that is convergent in the presence of a small parameter no longer converges when the parameter is set to zero before the series is summed.

The authors, correctly in my view, emphasize the physical importance of distinguishing between infinite systems and large finite systems. In their example discontinuities in certain physical quantities only exist (mathematically) for infinite systems.

I suggest, however, that the authors have demonstrated a different mathematical point than the one that they propose: infinite series live a life of their own and need not be constrained to be the limit of sequences of finite series. This point was made long ago by Borel and was probably known to Abel and Cauchy[4]. I emphasize the point with an example of an infinite series of resistive elements that sum to a negative resistance. The infinite series represents different physics from any of the possible finite series.

Let $\{R_i\}$ be a set of resistors, each having resistance $R_i = p^i R$ $p > 1$ and R an arbitrary resistance value. Then $Z_n = \sum_{i=0}^n R_i$ is the resistance of a set of such resistors connected in series, and the value of Z_n grows without bound as n increases. Clearly, a quantity Z defined by $Z \equiv \sum_{n=0}^{\infty} R_n$ makes no sense as a limit of a convergent sequence of finite sums.

We may, however, emulate Feynman[2] and define Z from the recursive relation $Z - R = pZ$ which follows from the definition of Z and the fact that an infinite series less a finite set of its members is still an infinite series¹. Solving the last equation for Z leads to the result that

$$Z = -R/(p - 1) \tag{1}$$

a negative resistance.

Feynman[2] also shows us how to build such infinite-series resistors. One simply terminates a finite-series resistor having resistance Z_n with a negative resistance having resistance $-p^{n+1}R/(p - 1)$. Each such resistor will then have negative resistance Z .

When the quantity p has values $p < 1$, there is no difference between the limit of a sequence Z_n of increasing n and the value Z obtained in Eq. 1. This does not mean that Eq. 1 is wrong, as the authors of Ref. 2 seem to imply. It does mean that the infinite sum involved represents two different physical situations when $p < 1$ and when $p > 1$, involving, respectively passive and active circuit elements.

This Comment is intended, however, to emphasize the mathematical fact that infinite (and infinitesimal) mathematical operations may be justified independently of arguments involving limits.[5]

I am indebted to Cosmas Zachos for bringing the Borel reference to my attention. This work was supported by the U.S. Department of Energy, Division of High Energy Physics, Contract W-31-109-ENG-38.

¹The series, in fact, satisfies Hardy’s criteria of $\mathfrak{X}$ -summability[3]

Bibliography

- [1] H. Krivine and A. Lesne, “Phase Transition-Like Behavior In A Low-Pass Filter”, Am. J. Physics, 71 (2003) 31
- [2] Feynman,*et al.*, *The Feynman Lectures on Physics* (Addison Wesley, Reading, MA 1964) Vol. II, p. 22-12
- [3] G. H. Hardy, *Divergent Series*, (Oxford at the Clarendon Press 1949) Section 1.3.
- [4] Émile Borel “Lectures on Divergent Series” (Critchfield and Vakar, trans.) Los Alamos National Laboratory Document LA-6140-TR (December 1975)
- [5] For an introduction and references to the subject of infinitesimals without limits see math.GM/0010065 in the Cornell archive and Chapter 3 of the Calculus text in progress, partially available at www.hep.anl.gov/jlu/index.html and inspired by the non-standard analysis of Abraham Robinson.